

| Submission No. | | | 031 | |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Organization Name or Name of Submitter | | | Butterfield District Residents Association | |
| | | | | |
| Item No. | Section Ref. | Page No. | Observation Statement | TII Response |
| Observation on a Strategic Infrastructure Development Application | | | | |
| 1 | Observation details 5. Grounds | 3 | We, the committee of Butterfield Residents’ Association, wish to make a submission on behalf of our residents relating solely to the permission sought to locate the terminus of MetroLink at Mander’s Terrace, Charlemont. BDRA would request that the terminus be located initially at Stephen’s Green for the moment so that further excavation can be deferred to allow other options to be explored. | <p>An end of line station at Charlemont, rather than St Stephen's Green has been proposed for the following reasons.</p> <p>The connection from St Stephens Green to Charlemont / Ranelagh is supported by the previous Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2016-2035) and the current Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2022-2042). The connection from St Stephens Green to Charlemont / Ranelagh is supported by the current Transport Strategy. The Transport Strategies were prepared by the National Transport Authority, scrutinised by the Joint Oireachtas Committee on Transport, and approved by the Minister for Transport. It notes in section 12.3.2, "Charlemont offers the optimal location for the primary interchange with the Green Line in response to growing demand in the longer term and is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future metro extensions to serve the southwest, south or southeast of the city region should sufficient demand arise.</p> <p>The proximity of the metro to the Luas line at Charlemont provides for a positive customer experience for all users with short interchange distance and due to the proximity, clear wayfinding and high visibility of the interchange. The interchange arrangements at Charlemont provide for significantly better interchange arrangements compared to an interchange at St Stephen's Green Station. Passengers wishing to interchange between Luas and metro at an alternative St Stephen's Green terminus would face a 500m-walk along a route either through St Stephen's Green park or along the footpath north of the park, which adds significantly to the time for interchange and therefore the overall journey time for passengers and a less positive customer experience for all interchange users. This passenger experience would be reduced further for those with mobility or visual impairments as well as those travelling to/from the airport with luggage.</p> <p>The section of MetroLink route between St Stephen's Green and Charlemont Stations contributes significantly to the overall benefits of the scheme. It serves a significant area of the south city of Dublin and offers enhanced access from the local area to the city centre and a direct connection to Dublin Airport. It serves key trip attractors including residential areas and offices / workplace locations, with high passenger boarding and alighting figures in the peak hours. During the morning peak, at Charlemont station the flows include 1,800 passengers alighting, 2,300 boarding and 1,229 passengers alighting, 2,276 boarding during the evening peak. The passenger numbers contribute significantly to the overall benefits of the scheme and the effect of these benefits outweigh the additional costs that are associated with the delivery and operation of the section from St Stephen's Green to Charlemont station. Further information is available in Chapter 7: Consideration of the Alternatives, section 7.7.8 MetroLink Southern Terminus Location.</p> <p>The location of the interchange at Charlemont does not preclude onward extension south. An interchange at Charlemont is supported by policy including the Dublin City Development Plan 2022 - 2028 and the Transport Strategy for the Greater Dublin Area. As noted by the GDA Transport Strategy 2022-2042, section 12.3.2, "Charlemont offers the optimal location for the primary interchange with the Green Line in response to growing demand in the longer term and is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future metro extensions to serve the south west, south or south east of the city region should sufficient demand arise."</p> <p>By extending MetroLink to Charlemont it provides for future proofing of the Green Line, bypassing the capacity constrained Luas on-street running section, and ensures potential future connectivity options are enabled, either to the Green Line or for extensions of the metro.</p> <p>The Charlemont Station interchange provides for increased passenger utilization of the MetroLink system, thereby increasing the benefits delivered by the Project, reflected by an improved Project Benefit Cost Ratio (BCR).</p> |
| 2 | Observation details 5. Grounds | 3 | BDRA considers a terminus located at Rathmines rather than Charlemont to be a more suitable option for the future. We would like to emphasize that we are fully supportive of MetroLink from Estuary to St Stephen’s Green and would wish for work to begin as soon as possible. | TII would note that the proposed route alignment from Estuary to Charlemont is consistent and compliant with the GDA Transport Strategy 2022-2042 (published in January 2023) which states that the south city terminus at Charlemont offers the optimal location for interchange with the Green Line in response to growing demand in the longer term and is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future metro extensions to serve the south west, south or south east of the city region should sufficient demand arise. Further southern extension does not form part of this RO application. |

| Submission No. | | | 031 | |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Organization Name or Name of Submitter | | | Butterfield District Residents Association | |
| | | | | |
| Item No. | Section Ref. | Page No. | Observation Statement | TII Response |
| Observation on a Strategic Infrastructure Development Application | | | | |
| 3 | Observation details 5. Grounds | 4 | <p>The following reasons apply:</p> <p>1. Lack of Bus connectivity at Charlemont.</p> <p>Charlemont is not served by many buses. When the BusConnects plan is fully in place Rathmines will be served by the A Spine at a rate of 33 buses per hour at peak times. Passengers using these buses could alight at Portobello and easily access the Rathmines terminus. Conversely, for Charlemont, the same passengers, many bound for the airport with luggage, would face a considerable walk along the canal on pathways not designed for the use of large numbers of pedestrians to use at once.</p> <p>The Railway Order plan contains no proposal for a proper infrastructure to facilitate these commuters. In addition, on arrival in Charlemont, those passengers must also use lifts/escalators to negotiate level changes. Such a scenario has obvious and needless negative consequences for those with mobility difficulties.</p> | <p>Response (1) above explains the rationale for the proposed MetroLink station at Charlemont noting it was chosen on the basis of its interchange potential with Luas, as well as local bus services. The section of the line between St Stephen's Green and Charlemont generates considerable benefits for the scheme in terms of increased patronage.</p> <p>In overall terms, Charlemont Station will provide for improvements to the public transport network resulting in decreases in private car usage/trips, increases in public transport usages and will facilitate walking and cycling to the station, without significantly impacting on the operation of the road network in the area.</p> <p>Future Metro services south of Charlemont do not form part of the Railway Order application. TII's role is to deliver Metrolink as supported by the Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2022-2042) and Dublin City Development Plan 2022-2028. The connection from St Stephens Green to Charlemont / Ranelagh is supported by the current Transport Strategy. The Transport Strategies were prepared by the National Transport Authority, scrutinised by the Joint Oireachtas Committee on Transport, and approved by the Minister for Transport. It notes in section 12.3.2, "Charlemont offers the optimal location for the primary interchange with the Green Line in response to growing demand in the longer term and is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future metro extensions to serve the southwest, south or southeast of the city region should sufficient demand arise."</p> <p>A microsimulation VisWalk model has been developed for the immediate area surrounding Charlemont Station during the operational phase. The model covers the full extent of the publicly accessible station area, including the immediate vicinity of the station entrance at street level, the Luas stop and nearby junctions at Charlemont Bridge. In order to accommodate the forecast demand from the proposed Charlemont Station, a new staircase with 2.4m stair width is proposed at the south east corner of Charlemont Luas stop. An elevator will also be provided at this location for persons of restricted mobility. Both are sized for MetroLink to Luas, and Luas to MetroLink passenger numbers.</p> <p>In addition, it is proposed that the pedestrian crossing on R111 Grand Parade will be repositioned to the front of the building being developed by Hines. With this infrastructure in place, the model indicates that the R111 Grand Parade will have an acceptable level of service overall, with some reductions in service seen at the pedestrian crossing where pedestrians are required to wait for a green phase at the signals. Overall, it is considered that the model displays an acceptable level of network performance.</p> <p>The proposed pedestrian crossing on Grand Parade will have minimal impact on the traffic flow along Grand Parade and can be programmed to operate in sync with the existing signalized junction at Grand Parade /Charlemont Street to maintain the flow of traffic movements. When the Project is operational, car mode share will decrease, with a reduction of up to approximately 830 car tips to and from the zones surrounding Charlemont Station over the 12hr period in 2065. In overall terms, the Charlemont Station will provide for improvements to the public transport network resulting in decreases in private car usage/trips, increases in public transport usages and will facilitate walking and cycling to the station, without significantly impacting on the operation of the road network in the area.</p> <p>Furthermore, TII have deliberately designed the Station with minimum set down space (with the exception of a drop-off on Grand Parade for persons of restricted mobility only) or room for taxi ranks so that it does not encourage the Station to be used as a terminus.</p> <p>TII would also note that all MetroLink stations have been designed in accordance with the principle of "Access for All", noting the reason for the provision of lifts within the stations is to provide access to all levels of the station for persons of restricted mobility.</p> <p>Current BusConnect routes run through Camden Street (A Spine) and Leeson Street Upper (E spine), both in a short walking distance from the proposed MetroLink Station therefore is no interaction issues between both project.</p> |
| 4 | Observation details 5. Grounds | 4 | <p>This proposal is supported in Jasper’s report for the NTA</p> <p><i>“The connection to Ranelagh could feasibly be deferred until there is clarity on the future of the Green Line (subject to an improved understanding of how this could physically be delivered in a scenario with Metro operational) ”</i></p> <p>For these reason BDRA strongly supports a future terminus at Rathmines rather than Charlemont.</p> | <p>TII are proposing a station at Charlemont for the reasons set out by responses (1) and (2) above, noting that a station at Charlemont is strategically optimally positioned to extend metro beyond Charlemont in the future, and that the section of the line between St Stephen's Green and Charlemont generates considerable benefits for the scheme in terms of increased patronage.</p> <p>TII do not agree with that the connect to Charlemont/ Ranelagh could be feasibly be deferred until there is clarity on the future of the Green Line.</p> |

| Submission No. | | | 031 | |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Organization Name or Name of Submitter | | | Butterfield District Residents Association | |
| | | | | |
| Item No. | Section Ref. | Page No. | Observation Statement | TII Response |
| Observation on a Strategic Infrastructure Development Application | | | | |
| 5 | Observation details 5. Grounds | 4 | 2.Further options for MetroLink have not been explored fully. Three options were identified by the NTA: <ul style="list-style-type: none">Continuing the Metro along the Green Luas lineExtending the Metro to UCDExtending the Metro to South West Dublin | As noted by response (2) above, none of the options for extending metro south in the future are precluded should the need arise. As noted in response item (3), future Metro services south of Charlemont do not form part of the Railway Order application. |
| 6 | Observation details 5. Grounds | 4 | The third option is of most interest to BDRA and its residents. BDRA contends that the area in between the two Luas lines is very poorly served by public transport at present and that BusConnects alone will not satisfy the future transport needs of this rapidly growing area. The feasibility study already made did not capture/reference all the transport needs of the entire area. The study confined itself to a possible Metro to Knocklyon thereby neglecting consideration of the travel needs of the wider area including much of Greater Tallaght/ Ballycullen whose residents have no easy access to the Luas. We would therefore request that a proper feasibility study with appropriate parameters be undertaken to explore this option. BDRA considers that the building of terminus at Charlemont would preclude any possibility of further development of this option in the future. | As noted by the GDA Transport Strategy 2022-2042, section 12.3.2, "Charlemont offers the optimal location for the primary interchange with the Green Line in response to growing demand in the longer term and is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future metro extensions to serve the south west, south or south east of the city region should sufficient demand arise.' TII assessed the routes within a specific corridor in line with the GDA strategy at that time, this did not include looking at options for metro southwest. Future extensions south of Charlemont do not form part of this Railway Order Application. |
| 7 | Observation details 5. Grounds | 4 | 3. The environmental benefits for extending the MetroLink to the south-west are many. BDRA recognizes that the population of Rathfarnham and its surrounding areas is growing rapidly. Extensive housing development is taking place in Scholarstown and It is already apparent that traffic is seriously gridlocked on local roads because many people rely on cars due to the woefully inadequate bus service in this area. This situation will deteriorate as more people move into these residences with the inevitable rise in carbon emissions. The issue of carbon emissions cannot be adequately addressed by excluding the Metrolink to the south west as commuters will still have to rely on cars to commute to work, for family visits, social events etc. thus adding to daily gridlock and longer journey times and all the while producing further harmful emissions. BDRA believes that the case for extending the MetroLink to the south-west is a very strong one. The human and economic benefits are many. | As noted by the responses above, the proposed station at Charlemont does not preclude the future extension of metro (including to the south-west) and is consistent and compliant with the GDA Transport Strategy 2022-2042 (published in January 2023) in which states that the south city terminus at Charlemont offers the optimal location for interchange with the Green Line in response to growing demand in the longer term and is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future metro extensions to serve the south west, south or south east of the city region should sufficient demand arise. |